

Fred C. Woudhuizen  
Heiloo  
The Netherlands

UDC: 811.1'373.21

## ON THE IDENTITY OF THE INDO-EUROPEAN SUBSTRATE IN WESTERN ANATOLIA

*Abstract:* Late Bronze Age hydronyms and toponyms bear testimony of the fact that Western Anatolia had once been inhabited by an Indo-European substrate which preceded the speakers of IE Anatolian. Now, in the present paper I try to find out whether it is possible to identify this Indo-European substrate with any of the population groups recorded by the historical sources. To my view at least, this is indeed possible owing to the fact that the historical sources bear testimony of Pelasgians as early, if not the earliest, inhabitants of Western Anatolia, whose language according to the same sources shows exactly the same features as the Indo-European substrate in question.

With respect to Late Bronze Age hydronyms and toponyms of Indo-European nature in Western Anatolia it deserves our attention that a number of the names shows features foreign to the Luwian language, which might be attributed to an Indo-European substrate. The relevant data in this respect are provided by *Apaša*, *Aštarpa* and *Apawiya* or *Abawiya*, in which instances the PIE laryngeal \*[h<sub>2</sub>] is not represented by [ḫ] as in the related IE Anatolian *ḫapa-* “river” and *ḫaštēr-* “star”, and *Ḫuršanašša*, *Lukka* and *Parḫa*, in which instances the voiced velars \*[g<sup>h</sup>] an \*[ǵ<sup>h</sup>] are, contrary to their regular loss in Luwian, preserved and variously expressed by laryngeal [ḫ] and/or velar [k]. Of this Indo-European substrate it could further be established that, for example, the root of the river-name *Šeḫa* may be attributed to it as it, in like manner as its Old Indo-European equivalent *Sequana*, can be traced back to PIE *\*seik<sup>w</sup>*- “to seep, soak” (Pokorny 1959: 893).<sup>1</sup> It finally deserves attention in this connection that, on account of the reflex of PIE \*[ǵ<sup>h</sup>] by laryngeal [ḫ]—which against the backdrop of the related Hittite *parku-* “high” in turn originates from velar [k] by lenition—in *Parḫa* < PIE *\*b<sup>h</sup>ǵ<sup>h</sup>(i)-* “high”, the Old Indo-European substrate of western Anatolia clearly belongs to the *centum*-group among the Indo-European family.

<sup>1</sup> As professor Meid kindly informed me in a letter dated February 1, 2014, the representation of this root with a palatal as *seḱ<sup>w</sup>*- in Whatmough 1963: 68 probably results from a printing error.

The question which arises after this exercise is: can the representatives of the Indo-European substrate in question be identified with a population group known from the historical sources. With this question in mind I reread I think for the fourth time the study by Fritz Lochner-Hüttenbach about the Pelasgians of 1960, and, much to my surprise, I came across references by classical Greek authors to Pelasgians along the entire coastal region of western Anatolia, from Lycia in the south to the southern part of the Troad in the north. In fact, these sources even provide evidence for Pelasgians outside the borders of the geographic entity under discussion, viz. Western Anatolia, by extending into the region to the east of Troy, namely the Propontis, Paphlagonia, up to and including the coastal area of Armenia (see Table I).

<b>region</b>	<b>source</b>	<b>page</b>
1. Lycia	Diodoros of Sicily, <i>The Library of History</i> 5, 81	p. 33
2. Caria	Strabo, <i>Geography</i> 14, 2, 27	p. 41
	Kallimachos, <i>Hymnos of Ceres</i> VI, 25	p. 23
3. Ionia	Menekrates van Elaia	p. 28
	<i>Scholia Graeca in Homeri Iliadem</i> 10, 429	p. 76
	Dionysos Periegetes 533	p. 57
4. Lydia	Homerios, <i>Iliad</i> 2, 840–843	p. 1
	Strabo, <i>Geography</i> 13, 3, 2	p. 39-40
5. Mysia	Hellanikos F 93	p. 5
	Strabo, <i>Geography</i> 5, 2, 4	p. 33
	Strabo, <i>Geography</i> 13, 3, 2	p. 39
6. N Aegean	Strabo, <i>Geography</i> 13, 3, 3	p. 40
	Diodoros of Sicily, <i>The Library of History</i> 5, 8	p. 33
	Strabo, <i>Geography</i> 5, 2, 4	p. 34
	Herodotos, <i>Histories</i> IV, 145, 2	p. 8
	Herodotos, <i>Histories</i> VI, 137–138	p. 8–9
	Herodotos, <i>Histories</i> V, 26	p. 8
	Herodotos, <i>Histories</i> II, 51	p. 6–7
	Herodotos, <i>Histories</i> I, 57	p. 5–6
	Thucydides, <i>Peloponnesian War</i> IV, 109, 2	p. 11–12
7. S Troad	Herodotos, <i>Histories</i> VII, 42	p. 10
	<i>Scholia Graeca in Homeri Iliadem</i> 6, 397	p. 76

8. Propontis	Herodotos, <i>Histories</i> I, 57	p. 5–6
	Deilochos of Kyzikos (= Scholia ad Apollonios Rhodios, <i>Argonautica</i> I, 987a)	p. 20–21
	Agathokles of Kyzikos (= Stephanos of Byzantion, <i>Ethnica</i> , s.v. Besbikos)	p. 27–28
	Konon F1	p. 55
	Ephoros F 61	p. 18
	Apollonios Rhodios, <i>Argonautica</i> 1, 1024	p. 24
	Apollodoros, <i>Bibliothēke</i> 1, 9, 18	p. 29
9. Paphlagonia	Strabo, <i>Geography</i> 8, 3, 17	p. 37
	Homerios, <i>Iliad</i> 2, 851 (Πυλαιμένης)	p. 154–155
10. Armenia	Apollonios Rhodios, <i>Argonautica</i> 1, 1024	p. 24

Table I. Overview of literary evidence for Pelasgians in Western Anatolia according to Lochner-Hüttenbach's *Die Pelasger* of 1960.

Now, it is well known that the Pelasgians belong to the pre-Greek population groups in Greece. Sometimes their heros eponym Pelasgos is expressly stated to be the first inhabitant, as in case of the Peloponnesos (Pausanias, *Guide to Greece* 8, 1, 4). More in general, the Pelasgians are addressed as being ἀρχαιότατοι “most old” (Strabo, *Geography* 7, 7, 10; 8, 8, 3), which in effect boils down to autochthonous in a relative sense, i.e. in comparison to other population groups distinguished. In my view the Pelasgians are in fact the earliest settlers in the Greek mainland speaking an Indo-European tongue, arriving in this region from c. 3100 BC onwards and in the main traceable only on the basis of some specific river- and place-names. Furthermore, Pelasgians are mentioned as early as from the times of Homerios onwards as one of the population groups inhabiting the island of Crete (Homerios, *Odyssey* 19, 175–177). As a matter of fact, the memory to the migration of the Pelasgians from Thessaly to Crete under the leadership of Teutamos as best preserved in Diodoros of Sicily, *The Library of History* 4, 60, 2, may be an ancient one, going back at least to Middle Minoan times (c. 2000–1600 BC) as a *terminus ante quem*. During the period of the upheavals of the Sea Peoples at the end of the Bronze Age, finally, we come across Pelasgians from Lydia in western Asia Minor and the island of Crete, who in the Egyptian hieroglyphic and Biblical sources feature as, respectively, *Peleset* and *Philistines*, and can even be traced in Luwian hieroglyphic in form of the ethnonym *Patisàtinà-* or *Wata<sub>4</sub>sàtinà-* or *Watisàtinà-* (Hawkins 2011). Most relevant in the present context, however, is the fact that the Pelasgians in the passage by Diodoros of Sicily, *The Library of History*

5, 81, are not merely addressed as autochthonous in a relative sense but more in specific as *the earliest inhabitants* in Lycia and the island of Lesbos!

Now, if only we are willing to take the Greek literary sources serious, the Pelasgians are positively identifiable as speakers of an Indo-European tongue. In any case, they are related in the aforesaid sources with names ultimately based on an Indo-European root (see Table II).

PIE root	Pelasgian name	source
1. <i>teutā</i> - “people, tribe”	Τεύταμος Τευταμίας	Diod. Sic. 4, 60, 2 Apollod. <i>Bibl.</i> 2, 4, 4
2. <i>*h<sub>2</sub>erǵ<sup>h</sup></i> - “white, bright”	Ἄργος	Aisch. <i>Suppl.</i> 250 ff.
3. <i>*h<sub>2</sub>eb<sup>(h)</sup></i> - “water, river”	Ἀπία	Schol. Aisch. <i>Or.</i> 990
4. <i>*g<sup>h</sup>ord<sup>h</sup></i> - “town”	Γυρτώνη	Strab. 9, 5, 22
5. <i>*h<sub>1</sub>epero</i> - “boar”	Ἐφύρα	Steph. Byz., s.v.
6. <i>*dānu</i> - “river”	Ἀπιδανός	Apoll. Rhod. 2, 265
7. <i>*akr</i> - “sharp, high”	Ἀκρίσιος	Kall. <i>Epigr.</i> 39, 2
8. <i>*méǵh<sub>2</sub></i> - “great, many”	Μαγνητίς	Strab. 9, 5, 22
9. <i>*b<sup>h</sup>ǵ<sup>h</sup>(t)</i> - “high”	Πύργοι	Strab. 5, 2, 8
10. <i>*l(e)ug<sup>h</sup></i> - “to bind”	Λυκία	Diod. Sic. 5, 81
11. ( <i>*méh<sub>2</sub>tēr</i> - “mother”	Δημήτηρ	Herod. II, 171-172)
12. <i>*h<sub>1</sub>er-/h<sub>3</sub>er</i> - “to move”	Ἄρνη	—

Table II. Names based on a Proto-Indo-European root associated in the Greek sources with Pelasgians.

In this overview, the case of the GN *Demeter* is placed between brackets, because it is related by Herodotos in his *Histories* II, 52 that the Pelasgians of Dodona had no names for their gods and in the given passage of the same book that Pelasgian women learned the cult of Demeter from the daughters of Danaos. So the relationship of the Pelasgians with the GN *Demeter* appears to be not original, but of a secondary nature.<sup>2</sup> Furthermore, the toponym

<sup>2</sup> Note however that Pausanias, *Guide to Greece* 1, 14, 2 informs us that Pelasgos receives Demeter in his house and that the latter deity is even straightforwardly called “Pelasgian” in Pausanias, *Guide to Greece* 2, 22, 1 (cf. Lochner-Hüttenbach 1960: 61-62). Furthermore, against the backdrop of the association of Zeus with Pelasgian Dodona in Homeros, *Iliad* 16, 233 (cf. Lochner-Hüttenbach 1960: 1), it may be argued that the incorporation of Zeus and Demeter in the Lydian pantheon in form of *Levś* of *Lefś* and *Lametru-*, respectively, both cases of which are characteri-

*Arne* is attested for various regions of Greece in which we come across Pelasgians, namely Phthiotis, Boiotia (Homerus, Strabo, Pausanias, and Stephanos of Byzantion) and Arcadia (Rosenkranz 1966: 127), but in actual fact not directly associated with them. Notwithstanding so, it is highly attractive to consider the place-name *Arne* a Pelasgian name against the backdrop of the fact that cape Mycale, which according to Menekrates of Elaia (Lochner-Hüttenbach 1960: 28) and *Scholia Graeca in Homeri Iliadem* 10, 429 (Lochner-Hüttenbach 1960: 76) was once inhabited by Pelasgians, in the Hittite sources is addressed to as *Arinnanda*, a derivative in *-nd-* of the related Hittite vocabulary word *arinna*-“source” (Starke 1997: 451; Hawkins 2002: 97-98), not to mention the fact that one of the main towns in Lycia, which according to Diodoros of Sicily, *The Library of History* 5, 81, is first inhabited by Pelasgians is called *Arñna* in the epichoric Lycian texts.

Whatever one may be apt to think of these latter two suggestions, it cannot be denied that a significant number of PIE roots which, as we have seen in the above, are involved in our attribution of Western Anatolian river- and place-names to an Indo-European substrate also feature in our list of Table II. This observation has a bearing on *\*h<sub>2</sub>eb<sup>h</sup>*- “water, river” from which *Apaša* and *Apawiya* or *Abawiya* are derived, *\*g<sup>h</sup>ord<sup>h</sup>*- “town” to which the first element of *Huršanašša* can be traced back, *\*b<sup>h</sup>rg<sup>h</sup>(i)*- “high” which stands at the basis of *Parha*, and *\*l(e)ug<sup>h</sup>*- “to bind” which provides us with the most plausible root for *Lukka*. It also deserves our attention in this connection that in three cases an offshoot of the given roots is also traceable in Crete, namely in the case of *Gortyns* < *\*g<sup>h</sup>ord<sup>h</sup>*- “town”, *Pyrgiotissa* < *\*b<sup>h</sup>rg<sup>h</sup>(i)*- “high”, and *ru-ki-to* “Lyktos”, related to western Anatolian *Lukka* and therefore likewise originating from *\*l(e)ug<sup>h</sup>*. It might be added to this that in Crete we further find the presumably Pelasgian GN *da-ma-te* “Demeter” in a Linear A inscription (Sakellarakis & Olivier 1994), not to mention the related form of the Old Indo-European river-name *Šeša* < *\*seik<sup>w</sup>*- in the form of the TN *Saharwa* “Skheria (= presumably Hagia Triada)”. Finally, the examples provided by *\*akr-* “sharp, high”, *\*h<sub>2</sub>erĝ<sup>h</sup>*- “white, bright”, *\*méĝh<sub>2</sub>*- “great, many”, and *\*b<sup>h</sup>rg<sup>h</sup>(i)*- “high” as represented by the MN *Akrisios* and the TNs *Argos*, *Magnetis*, and *Pyrgoi* definitely point out that the language of the Pelasgians, just like the Indo-European substrate in Western Anatolia, belongs to the *centum*-group among the Indo-European family.

zed by *d/l*-change with respect to the initial dental [d], results from influence exercised by the Pelasgians living in the region of Larissa Phryconis on the Lydians. If this argument holds water, it may reasonably be inferred that the Pelasgians venerated a male deity whose name originates from *\*deus* “god” and bears testimony of the widely attested PIE root *\*Dyēws* for the sky-god.

In line with the foregoing observations, then, it seems highly likely that the Indo-European substrate in Western Anatolia as deducible from hydronyms and toponyms is to be identified with the Pelasgians recorded by the Greek sources for the region in question. This population group settled along the coastal areas and did not penetrate into the inner parts of Asia Minor, in contrast to the Luwians whose distribution by and large can be traced on the basis of that of the in this respect diagnostic place-names in *-ss-* and *-nd-* (Laroche 1957: 7; Laroche 1961: 72). Of course, seen within the framework of other evidence for on Indo-European deep-layer in Anatolia as represented amongst others by place-names in *-nuwa*, which may reasonably be argued to have arrived in the subcontinent from *c.* 3100 BC onwards and therefore precedes the IE Anatolian one introduced in this particular region from *c.* 2300 BC onwards, the Pelasgians were to all likelihood only *one* of the population groups which all together formed an Old Indo-European substrate layer in Anatolia as a whole.

At any rate, what counts in the long run is that the scenario we thus arrive at is particularly devastating for the theory propagated by scholars like Colin Renfrew (1987) and Robert Drews (2001) which maintains that Anatolia is the Indo-European homeland. In actual fact, the IE Anatolian languages, which are generally considered to represent the oldest stage of the Indo-European language family, were latecomers in the Anatolian subcontinent and preceded by speakers of related languages which lack the preservation of PIE laryngeal \*[h<sub>2</sub>] in form of [h]—i.e. precisely the feature which is considered diagnostic for the earliest stage of Indo-European!

#### BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Drews, R. 2001: Greater Anatolia, Proto-Anatolian, Proto-Indo-Hittite, and Beyond, in: Drews, R. (ed.), *Greater Anatolia and the Indo-Hittite Language Family, Papers Presented at a Colloquium Hosted by the University of Richmond, March 18-19, 2000, Journal of Indo-European Studies Monograph Series: Number 38*, 248-283, Washington D.C.: The Institute for the Study of Man.
- Hawkins, J.D. 2002: “The historical geography of western Anatolia in Hittite texts”, in: Easton, D.F., Hawkins, J.D., Sherratt, A.G., & Sherratt, E.S., *Troy in recent perspective, Anatolian Studies* 52, pp. 75-109 (pp. 94-101).
- Hawkins, J.D. 2011: “The Inscriptions of the Aleppo temple”. *Anatolian Studies* 61, pp. 35-54.
- Laroche, E. 1957: “Notes de toponymie anatolienne”, in: Kronasser, H. (Hrsg.), *Mnēmēs Charin: Gedenkschrift Paul Kretschmer*, Wien: Hollinek, pp. 1-7.

- Laroche, E. 1961: “Études de toponymie anatolienne”, *Revue Hittite et Asiatique* 69, pp. 57-91.
- Lochner-Hüttenbach, F. 1960: *Die Pelasger*, Arbeiten aus dem Institut für vergleichende Sprachwissenschaft, Wien: Gerold & Co.
- Renfrew, C. 1987: *Archaeology and Language, The Puzzle of Indo-European Origins*, London: Jonathan Cape.
- Rosenkranz, B. 1966: “Flusz- und Gewässernamen in Anatolien”, *Beiträge zur Namenforschung, neue Folge* 1, pp. 124-144.
- Sakellarakis, I., & Olivier, J.P., “Une vase de Pierre avec inscription en linéaire A de Cythère”, *Bulletin de Correspondence Hellénique* 118, pp. 343-351.
- Starke, F. 1997: “Troia im Kontext des Historisch-Politischen und Sprachlichen Umfeldes Kleinasisiens im 2. Jahrtausend”, *Studia Troica* 7, pp. 447-487.
- Whatmough, J. 1963: *The Dialects of Ancient Gaul, Grammar Part I*, Ann Arbor-Michigan: Edwards Brothers.

#### PIE roots

- Pokorny, J. 1959: *Indogermanisches Etymologisches Wörterbuch. I. Band*, Bern: A. Francke AG Verlag.
- Gamkrelidze, Th.V., & V.V. Ivanov 1995: *Indo-European and the Indo-Europeans, A Reconstruction and Historical Analysis of a Proto-Language and a Proto-Culture, Part I: The Text, Part II: Bibliography, Indexes*, Berlin-New York: Mouton de Gruyter.
- Mallory, J.P., & Adams, D.Q. 2007: *The Oxford Introduction to Proto-Indo-European and the Proto-Indo-European World*, Oxford: Oxford University Press (Reprint of 2006 edition).